Defraudar la compostura: On the Musical Work-Concept in Early Modern Spain (1536-1565)

Pilar Ramos López
Universidad de La Rioja
pilar.ramos@unirioja.es

Abstract

In my contribution to the debate on the concept of musical work, I include sources that so far have not been considered, mainly the treatises of Juan Bermudo and the books of music for vihuela by Luis Milán, Enríquez Valderrábano, and Miguel de Fuenllana, all of them published in Spanish between 1536 and 1565, and widely read at the time. Far from making occasional remarks, these authors gave serious and constant thought to issues such as the completeness of the work (hence the warning against the overuse of glosses), the relevance of the authorship, the fidelity to the work, the knowledge embedded in musical works, and the idea of overcoming past music. According to the authors mentioned, these features were found only in what they labeled as "superior music" and therefore were missing in other pieces of lower quality music. In particular, the warning against the overuse of glosses allows us to approach the musical work-concept from a broader context than the one considered to date. I also will discuss some cultural and legal traditions that favored both an awareness of authorship and the musical work-concept in sixteenth-century Spain.

Keywords: Music theory; 16th century; Spain; Juan Bermudo; Music for vihuela; Musical work-concept.

Introduction[1]

In his book *The Open Work*, Umberto Eco gives a precise definition of the basic features shared by the kind of musical works that were being rejected by composers like Karlheinz Stockhausen and Luciano Berio at the time. Far from approaching the artwork from a reductionist perspective, the Italian semiotician understood that openness is inherent to all artworks to a greater or lesser extent. In particular, the works of his contemporaries Stockhausen and Berio "are 'open' in a far more tangible sense. In primitive terms we *can* say

1. I thank Ana López Suero for her insightful revision of the text, and Celia Montolío, Teresa Pelinski and Adam Barkley for their help with the English writing. This work was supported by the Spanish Ministerio de Economía, Industria y Competitividad under the research grant *La obra musical renacentista: fundamentos, repertorios y prácticas* (HAR2015-70181-P), led by Soterraña Aguirre Rincón.

Licencia Creative Commons 4.0 "Reconocimiento-Sin Derivar- No Comercial" http://doi.org/10.7764/res.2025.57.9.
Fecha de recepción: 28-01-2024/ Fecha de aceptación: 17-06-2025.

that they are quite literally 'unfinished'."[2] This lack of closure had already been noticed by Theodor Adorno, who stated that "[t]oday the only works which really count are those which are no longer works at all" (Adorno 1973 [1948], 30).

The concept of work of art was established during the second half of eighteenth century, intertwined with other ideas about art, autonomy, creativity (or genius), beauty, form, and aesthetic experience, as Wladyslaw Tatarkiewicz (1980 [1976]) and Terry Eagleton (1990) concluded. Concurrently, musicologist Hans Eggebrecht (1977, 222 and ff.), Carl Dahlhaus (1987 [1978]), and Walter Wiora (1988) defined the concept of musical work that has prevailed since the nineteenth century. On this topic, Lydia Goehr emphasized the importance of the notion of *Werktraue* ("ideal of fidelity or authenticity") as a relevant question with broader implications for music and theatre –insofar as they are performing arts– than for literature and visual arts (Goehr 2007, 243-286). However, Goehr seems to overlook the fact that the concept of *Werktraue* was central to the hermeneutic tradition of editing and translating texts which, as we will see, left its mark on sixteenth-century instructions for singers and instrumentalists. In fact, the title of this paper, *Defraudar la compostura,* comes from the vihuelist Miguel de Fuenllana's warning against various possible ways of disturbing the musical composition (Fuenllana 1554, 5r). In this way, he considered that the work instead should be respected, as I will argue. Several decades of social history and *Begriffsgeschichte* (Conceptual history or History of concepts) have taught us that theoretical definitions on their own do not enable us to understand historical concepts; we do need to understand both the practices and the usage of the terms. Thus, this paper aims precisely to understand the uses and practices of the musical work-concept within a specific context: the Spain of the middle of the sixteenth century.

Dahlhaus stated that in the sixteenth century the musical-work concept was borrowed from poetics and the theory of art (Dahlhaus 1978, 220). The assimilation of the musical work to the literary work was a long process that cannot be disengaged from the main issues –condensed in Horatio's oft-quoted *ut pictura poesis*– concerning other arts, such as architecture and painting. Unlike the visual arts, music belonged to the liberal arts, although it was not integrated into the language arts (*trivium*) but into the mathematical arts (*quadrivium*) instead. This liberal quality covered not only theoretical aspects of music but its practical aspects as well, as this "liberality" spared composers from paying "*alcabalas*" (taxes imposed on all the trades).[3]

In understanding the concept of musical work in the Spanish sixteenth century, besides considering the notion of authorship, I emphasize the need to consider glosses. *Glosas* ("glosses") and *glosados* ("glossed") are frequent terms in the titles of vocal and instrumental pieces published in Castile and Aragon throughout the sixteenth century. Insofar as music

2. "[...] a classical composition, whether it be a Bach fugue, Verdi's *Aida*, or Stravinsky's *Rite of Spring,* posits an assemblage of sound units which the composer arranged in a closed, well-defined manner before presenting it to the listener. He converted his idea into conventional symbols which more or less oblige the eventual performer to reproduce the format devised by the composer himself' [...]" "A work of art, therefore, is *a* cornpiece and *closed* form in its uniqueness *as a* balanced organic whole, while at the same time constituting *an open* product on account of its susceptibility to countless different interpretations which do not impinge on its unadulterable specificity. Hence, every reception of a work of art is both an *interpretation* and a *performance* of it, because in every reception the work takes on a fresh perspective for itself" (Eco 1989 [1962], 2-3 and 4).

3. On the controversies surrounding the *alcabalas* and their impact on the status of the artist, see Gállego (1976).

treatises and books present glosses as dependent on the prior piece or "work," they allow us to approach the musical work-concept within a broader context than the one considered to date, largely thanks to Reinhard Strohm's research on Italian, Polish, French, and German sources (Strohm 2000; 2010; 2013). In particular, Strohm focuses on Nicolai Listenius, whose statement about Josquin's *opus perfectum et absolutum* resembles some of the commentaries considered below. Adopting Strohm's standpoint, Laurenz Lüttenek (2015) has demonstrated that the concept of a musical work appeared as early as the fifteenth century. Both Strohm and Lüttenek date the emergence of a concept of musical work significantly earlier than the widely accepted view which situates its establishment ca. 1800.

In my contribution to the debate on the musical work-concept,[4] I include sources that, despite being well known, have not been considered, mainly the treatises of Juan Bermudo and the books of music for vihuela by Luis Milán, Enríquez Valderrábano, and Miguel de Fuenllana. All of them were published in Spanish between 1536 and 1565 and widely read at the time.[5] With the exception of Juan Bermudo,[6] who was not a professional musician, most of these musicians were employed as performers by noblemen. The musical life of the noble houses is well documented, as the strength of the spectacles, plays, songs, poetry, and library and artistic collections required a significant number of musicians, writers, and artists.[7] In particular, the books for vihuela were addressed not only to beginners but also to highly qualified performers who could play the most intricate counterpoint. Thus, these sources inform us about musical practices in a more direct way than theorists of the time. What makes these sources relevant to the subject is the clarity and consistency of their commentaries on the musical works. Far from making occasional remarks, these authors gave serious and constant thought to issues such as the completeness of the work, the relevance of authorship, the fidelity to the work, the knowledge inherent to musical works (as we will see, a work can teach), and the overcoming of past music. These features were only found in what was labeled as "good music" and therefore were missing in other pieces of music. They broadly correspond with the premises pinpointed by Lütteken (2015) and Strohm (2010).

Finally, in relation to the notion of work and authorship, a Spanish particularity should be considered. In Spain, it was the author (not the printer) who held the printing rights. To be published, a book had to meet royal approval, regardless of its content; there was no difference between a book on music and a book on philosophy. Should a pirate edition have been discovered, it was possible for its original author to pursue legal action; such was the case with Fuenllana (Griffiths 1993).

Through the sixteenth century, Iberian kings' possessions extended to Flemish, Italian, and American lands. Thus, different cultural trends converged in continuous turmoil across the Iberian Peninsula, where they transformed and spread. The significance of print laws and

4. A survey of the polemics is provided by John Butt (2015).

5. Although the treatise by Santa María was printed in 1565, the author had already obtained a license to print the same book in Valladolid in 1557, as the royal license states. With respect to the copies, an impression of 1000 copies is documented for Fuenllana's *Orphenica Lyra*, 1225 for Cabezón's *Obras* and 1500 for Santa María's *Arte de tañer,* see Griffiths (1993, 23).

6. Bermudo's books provide all the extant data about his life. Wolfgang Freis (1995) offers a critical review of Bermudo's treatises. For a study of Bermudo's theory, see Otaola (2000).

7. For further discussion on music in sixteenth-century noble houses in Castile and Aragon, see Schwartz (2001), Roa (2015), Gómez Fernández (2017), and Colella (2019). For the status of musicians, see López Suero (2021).

the Inquisition cannot be understood without acknowledging the fragility of political power in the Castilian and Aragonese kingdoms, which was a result of the ethnic diversity and the rivalries between powerful noble families. As these kingdoms only shared one institution –the Inquisition or *Santo Oficio*– the Inquisition and the legislation surrounding the print were crucial instruments in the endeavour to consolidate royal authority. Thus, attributing authorship was a fundamental matter.

The legal framework and the close links between poets and musicians in the courts encouraged increasing awareness of the notion of authorship. It is worth noting that musical printing was not as active in Spanish cities as it was in Paris, Lyon, Venice, Rome, or Antwerp. However, in Spain we find more "authored" music books that bore the names of their composers, who also had direct involvement in their production.[8] Incidentally, poetry books were typically authored, and some composers were poets as well: amongst others, vihuelist Luis Milán, who included many poems in his *Libro de motes* (1535) and in *El cortesano* (1561). Both a poet and a musician, Juan del Encina (1468-ca.1530) gave the name "*obras*" (works) to the poems he published (without music) in his *Cancionero de todas las obras de Juan del Enzina* (Salamanca, 1496), the first songbook by a single author to be printed in Spain. Interestingly, however, the musical settings authored by him in *Cancionero de Palacio* –together with a large number of *villancicos* and songs, both anonymous and by other authors– are never referred to as "works".[9] Before we delve into the aforementioned aspects of the musical work-concept, we should examine first how authorship was understood in sixteenth-century Spain.

1. On authorship

Michel Talbot has claimed that between approximately 1780 and 1820, genre-centered and performer-centered musical practice became composer-centered instead (Talbot 2000, 172). The new status of the composer in the early-nineteenth century should not make us overlook the fact that the idea of authorship already had a long history. Interestingly, Johannes Tinctoris –the first theorist to explain and quote technical details of compositions by living authors– was employed at the royal court (Woodley 2001), surrounded with poets and humanists for whom the concept of authorship had a longstanding tradition. Two other early treatises in which we find examples of compositions including their authors' names are Ramos de Pareja's *Musica practica* (1482) and Anonymous from Seville's *Ars mensurabilis* (1480/2). Bermudo continued the tradition of contemporary quoting.[10] Quotations of this kind can be interpreted as a sign of "the new respect for the artist and his work," according to Edward Lowinsky (1989 [1964], I: 58).

8. In other countries music books "were 'authored' by scribes, compilers, editors, and printer-booksellers, often without the direct involvement of composers or concern for attributing" (Van Orden 2014, 15).

9. The *Cancionero de Palacio* is an anonymous manuscript, dated 1496-1520 by Emilio Ros Fábregas and Fernando Sánchez Pérez in the web Books of Hispanic Polyphony https://hispanicpolyphony.eu/source/13370 (accessed 25 January 2025).

10. Ramos de Pareja discusses examples by Johannes Ockeghem *(Missa l'homme armé)*, Urrede, Du Fay (without mentioning him), Busnoys, and his own motet *Tu lumen* and canon *Requiem aeternam* (Rami 1482, Part II, 34 r- 36v, and Chapters iii and iv; Rami 1901, 131-34). The anonymous manuscript *Ars mensurabilis* includes the examples "Missa by Henricus Tihz" [Tich] and the *Missa de Felix Pueritia*, whose author he does not name (Anonymous 1480/82, 44v). Bermudo quotes, for example, the fragment corresponding to the words "*votum in Hierusalem*" of the Introit of the Mass Requiem by Morales (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 139r).

Theorist Juan Bermudo's closeness to humanist concerns, such as the high value given to the author, the work, and fame, is most likely connected to the fact that –as he underlines at the beginning of his treatise– he studied at the University of Alcalá de Henares. Although he was a Franciscan friar, his background (and therefore his writing style) was not typical among other musicians linked to church chapels. It is worth noting that Bermudo ascribes great value to the author of the original intabulated work: amongst his practical recommendations for *poner* ("putting or playing")[11] a work with the vihuela, he suggests that the author's name and the work's title be included at the beginning in order to heighten its value.[12] Furthermore, Bermudo refers in the last chapter of his book to "the composer's intention" when explaining the proportion 9:6:4.[13]

The extant books for vihuela usually give the names of the authors of the original pieces. In particular, this information is never missing in mass movements and motets; in fact, Miguel de Fuenllana adds adjectives such as "famous," "excellent," or "very excellent" to the names of the motet authors.[14] Also a vihuelist, Diego Pisador speaks of "very famous authors."[15] However, the books by Cabezón (1578) and Venegas de Henestrosa (1557) collect many *villanescas* and *villancicos* without naming the authors.

Just like the theorists, musicians were aware of the fact that their music would be appreciated both in musical terms and in connection with its author. In the words of vihuelist Enríquez de Valderrábano: "I know well that many will grumble about this work and its author, marking defects in its invention, variety, brevity, composition, and artifice."[16] These words reflect how composing was considered a mental (i.e., not physical) activity, as the author of the printing license for Fuenllana's book points out: "That you have composed a book of music for vihuela, which is entitled *Orphenica Lyra,* in which, by reason of its difficulty, you have undergone much spiritual labour."[17]

In this context we find praise for composers with an "inborn" talent, in similar terms to those of Giovanni Spataro (1529), Henricus Glareanus' *Dodekachordon* (1547), and Adrianus Petit Coclico's *Compendium Musices* (1552) (see Lowinsky 1989, 50, 51 and 56; Young 2011 and 2023). A well-known praise of the organist Antonio de Cabezón, was allegedly written by his son Hernando:

---

11. As Freis has noted (1995, 4, note 50), Bermudo uses the verb *poner* to refer both to the act of scoring or intabulating polyphony (a written process) and to performing that polyphony on the instrument.

12. "Pongan mas sobre la obra el autor de ella: porque el titulo le da gran ser y qualidad. Digan que tono es" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 98v). Cobarruvias' dictionary defines "title" first as "el nombre que ponemos al libro en el principio" (the name what we put at the beginning of the book) and later as "El derecho que cada uno tiene a alguna cosa" (the right that everyone has to something) (Cobarruvias 1977 [1611], 964).

13. Some singers do not sing "la intinción del componedor. Porque si quisiera, que se cantara como una proporción, sola una pusiera y no dos [...] El cantante que quisiere guardar en el sobredicho caso la intinción del componedor, debe cantar nueve contra quatro" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 140v).

14. "famosos autores" (Fuenllana 1554, 14r), "excelentes autores" (Fuenllana 1554, 3v), "muy excelentes" (Fuenllana 1554, 59 r.).

15. "famosísimos autores" (Pisador 1552, 25 r); "motetes de grandes autores" (Pisador 1552, 2 r).

16. "Bien sé que muchos murmurarán desta obra y de su auctor, poniendo faltas en la invención, en la variedad, en la brevedad, en la compostura, en el artificio della" (Valderrábano 1547, a3).

17. "que vos aveys compuesto un libro de música para vihuela que se intitule Orphenica Lyra: en que por su dificultad aveys pasado mucho trabajo de espíritu" (Fuenllana 1554, 2r, pdf 5). English translation by Jacobs (Fuenllana 1978, p. lxxxi).

> Such is God's liberality in compensating men for what he takes away from them, that in exchange for depriving Antonio de Cabezón of the faculty of seeing, he endowed him with a wondrous sight of the spirit, opening the eyes of his mind in order that he could grasp the profound subtleties of this art and stretch it out to limits heretofore uncharted; and he deemed it good that God should have furnished his understanding with this gift.[18]

The vihuelist Miguel de Fuenllana, who was also blind, had already linked his lack of sight to his divine gift of talent.[19] As for Juan Bermudo, he admits that a good musician can get past the rules and *inventar el arte* ("invent the art").[20] Bermudo calls Cristóbal de Morales, the composer whom he held in the highest regard, "light of Spain in Music" (1957 [1555], 85r).[21] After Morales's death, Juan Vásquez referred to him as the "light of Music" (1946 [1560], 23), a status whose biblical overtones of divine attribution would certainly not have gone

---

18. "Es Dios tan liberal en las recompensas que da por lo que a los hombres quita, que por el usufructo de la vista corporal que quitó a Antonio de Cabeçón, le dio una vista maravillosa del ánimo, abriéndole los ojos del entendimiento para alcançar las subtilezas grandes desta arte y llegar en ella a donde hombre humano jamás llegó, y bien se paresció aver rescibido este don, de su ingenio de mano de Dios" (Hernando de Cabezón 1578, 5v).

19. "Y puesto que a la bondad Divina, por oculto juicio suyo, le plugo dende mi infancia privarme de la luz corporal, no permitió su grandeza, que mis trabajos quedasen sin fructo, pues en esta parte quiso comunicarme este talento. El qual por ser don suyo y dado de su liberalidad, me pareció que debía no tenerlo escondido, pues podía con el aprovechar a los que se precian de tan virtuoso exercicio, sacando a luz esta obra, primicias de mis trabajos" (Fuenllana 1554, 2v) ("And since in divine benevolence, by His hidden judgement, He was pleased to deprive me from my infancy of corporeal light, His greatness did not permit my labours to remain fruitless, for He wished in this way to import to me this talent. Which, though being [a] gift [of] His and provided by His liberality it appeared to me that I ought not to keep it concealed, because, with hit, I could render profit to those who appreciate such a virtuous exercise –[by] publishing this work, [the] first fruits of my labours.") English translation by Charles Jacobs in Fuenllana (1978, xxxii). Further on, "mayormente estando yo en esta corporal tiniebla, en que el señor me quiso poner, fue por le servir con el mismo don de su larga mano rescebido [...] Porque conforme a la evangelica ley el que no diere de su talento ganancia, por muy cierto debe tener su castigo. Que poco provecho haze en la republica el que su tesoro tiene escondido en el arca. Y movido con esta beningna voluntad y no menor charidad, quise componer esta obra" (Fuenllana 1554, 3v) ("Especially since I am in this corporeal darkness, in which the Lord wished to place me, was to serve him with the very gift received from His liberal hand, [...] Because in conformity to evangelical law, he who does not afford profit from his talent certainly ought to have his punishment. How little good he who keeps his treasure hidden in the ark does in the republic. And moved by this benign wish and no less charity, I endeavored to compose this work"). English translation by Charles Jacobs in Fuenllana (1978, lxxxv).

20. "Quien tiene licencia de augmentar la Musica" Ca. xiii, Lib. IV: Gran diferencia ay entre dos palabras [...] Contra arte o allende de arte. Puede un músico de buen entendimiento, favorecido de arte inventar cosas que no han sido inventadas, o si las han dicho, él no las ha visto, o si las ha visto, decirlas por nuevo modo, lo cual será allende de el arte. Tienen los tales licencia para ello, porque el arte de buenos juicios salió, y de buenos está aprobada. Así que, los músicos tienen licencia de aumentar el arte, pero ninguno (si no fuere atrevido) puede contra arte aprobada inventar, porque esto sería destruir y no edificar" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 66v).

21. As Stevenson noted, Morales was the only first-rate Renaissance composer who gave his stamp of approval on a treatise, one by Bermudo (Stevenson 1960, 60). Morales even wrote a commendatory letter prefacing book V of the *Declaración,* whose authenticity has been questioned by Freis (1995, 75). Bermudo also calls him "egregio músico" ("eminent musician") (1957 [1555], 55r and 65v), and "singular" (1957 [1555], 55v). Along with Morales, a lesser-known composer, Bernardino de Figueroa, appears in the title page. According to Bermudo, de Figueroa was "único en habilidades" ("unique in skills") (1957 [1555], 85r.), and "profundo y sapientísimo músico" ("deep and very wise musician") (1957 [1555], 63r.), Gombert is *profundo* ("deep"), and Adriano [Willaert] *excelente* ("excellent") (1957 [1555], 65v). Good musicians are usually called by Bermudo "grandes músicos" ("great musicians") (1957 [1555], 135r), "excelentes hombres" "músicos excelentes" ("excellent men" "excellent musicians") (1555, 135r), "hombres eruditos en el arte de composición" ("erudite men in the art of composing") (1957 [1555], 135r), "doctos en el arte de composición" ("scholars in the art of composing"), (1957 [1555], 136v), "doctos en música" ("scholars in music") (1957 [1555],141v).

unnoticed at the time.[22] In this respect, it is worth mentioning that Venegas de Henestrosa refers to God as the *componedor* ("composer").[23]

2. The musical work-concept

Sixteenth-century poets and writers refer to their poems and books as *obras* ("works"). This is also the term writers used to refer to their music treatises, and musicians, composers of (sacred or secular) vocal music, and instrumentalists, to refer to their compositions. Thus, Luis Milán says: "And, following my inclination, I find myself with a book made from many works which I got from the vihuela and I had written down."[24]

Antonio de Nebrija's Spanish-Latin dictionary (1494) translates Spanish *obra, la misma cosa hecha* ("work, the very thing made") into the Latin *opus*. The word *obra* ("work") was used in sixteenth-century Spanish to refer to any kind of human-made objects, including books, songbooks with or without music notation, poems, playscripts, and even human actions. In this common-language usage, the word "work" was not employed to convey a perceived greater quality. That is, it was not used in a qualitative sense. However, as I argue in this paper, this was not the case in the context of music: musical pieces that were valued more than others of the same genre were distinctively regarded as "works." In particular, I argue that the usage of the term "work" in such cases goes hand in hand with a specific notion of musical work. In the texts discussed below, the pieces of music separately called "works" are motets, masses, and *fantasías* that fulfill certain requirements (finished, in the new style, authored, and with inherent wisdom). Conversely, simpler and homophonic *villancicos, romances* and dances were hardly ever called "works" on their own, yet a collection or a book of *villancicos* was referred to as an *obra* ("work"). As we will see in the next pages, the warning against the overuse of glosses can help us to understand the concept of musical work at the time.

Let us address now the main features involved in the concept of musical work according to the authors considered here.

a. The finished work: the impossibility of the gloss

Following the tradition already established in thirteenth-century Castilian prose and poetry, a *glosa* ("gloss") was a commentary, and as such it involved an earlier *obra* ("work") or a *texto* ("text").[25] For instance, in a poem from the late fourteenth century we read that "bad glosses"

22. Note that in comparison with his assessment of Morales, Vásquez considers Francisco Guerrero, then about 31 years old, only one of the "excellent men" (1946 [1560], 23). Regarding Morales as the "light of Spain" perhaps it is worth remembering that the *alumbrados* (illuminated) had been considered heretical, and as such they were victims of the Inquisition, or the *Santo Oficio*.

23. "aquel componedor que todo lo criado ordenó en concordancia y música" ("that composer who ordered all that is raised in concordance and music") (Venegas de Henestrosa 1557, pdf 12).

24. "Y siguiendo mi inclinación heme hallado un libro hecho de muchas obras que de la vihuela tenía sacadas y escritas" (Milán 1536, 3r). Note that Jacobs translates *obras* for things: "And, following my inclination, I have created a book made of many things which were derived from the vihuela and written down" (1971, 11-12).

25. Besides "glosa," Palencia includes "glosario" and "glossema" (Palencia 1490). Nebrija's dictionary specifies that in Latin "glosador" is *expositor*, commentator (Nebrija 1954 [1494]). According to Cobarruvias, "Glosa. *Latine glossa;* es

are the reason why pagans deny the text, i.e., the Scripture.[26] In the fifteenth century, glosses could be both literary or musical commentaries. Both literary and musical examples make it clear that the added commentary (the gloss) is subordinate to the preexisting element (the work). Thus, a madrigal or a song could be glossed. This dependence on the preexisting piece is important as it distinguishes glosses from other kinds of improvisations. Glosses are not free extemporizations. Even in manuscripts where the original text and the gloss were copied at the same time, we find the latter written in the margins in a smaller script, a layout which printed books would later preserve.

One of the first treatises that discusses glosses is the *Arte de melodia sobre canto lano y canto dorgano* (ca. 1475-1525).[27] This anonymous manuscript calls the ornamentation of a plainchant interval a "melody," so that the gloss is only one of the various types of melody.[28] In other words, we see that what is here referred to as melody will be given the name of "gloss" a few years later by musicians such as Diego Ortiz, Bermudo, Mudarra, Narváez, and Santa María. In contrast to authors who include several pages with unnamed examples of ornamentation, the *Arte de melodia* gives a different name to each of the four possible ways of ornamentation displayed for every interval.

In his well-known *Tratado de glosas* (1553), Diego Ortiz regards the gloss as a melodic procedure. In book I of his *Tratado,* Ortiz begins with the glosses of the "cláusulas" (cadences) on the *finalis* of every mode and proceeds with examples for glossing ascending and descending seconds, thirds, fourths, and fifths. For the polyphonic setting produced by the addition of glosses, Ortiz prefers the term *recercadas (recercatas* in the Italian edition), with which he also refers to the polyphonic pieces to which he has added a part. Thus, Ortiz never refers to *O felicci occhi miei* as a glossed madrigal, nor to *Douce memoir* as a glossed song.

The treatises on music that teach instrumentalists and singers how to *glosar* ("gloss") use the terms *obra* ("work") and *texto* ("text") interchangeably –as the poets do– to refer to the preexisting object of the gloss. The dependence of the gloss on the work is underlined by the verbs used to describe their process of production: works *se hacen* ("are made"), while glosses *se echan* ("are added or thrown").

Warning against the risks of glossing was not uncommon nor new among scholars dealing with the Scriptures and Classical Antiquity in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.[29] Yet,

---

nombre griego, γλωσσα, glossa, vale *lingua,* pero comúnmente se toma por las anotaciones y comentos que declaran los textos o otra qualquier escritura, por quanto son como lenguas e intérpretes. Glossar alguna cosa escrita o dicha, es interpretarla. Glossar las palabras; vulgarmente es darles otro sentido del que suena y a vezes del que pretendió el que las dixo" (Cobarruvias 1977 [1611], 644).

26. "E por nuestra ventura, oy así pasa esto | contra nos son los paganos, en fabla e en jesto; | por nuestras malas glosas, ellos niegan el testo; | así se vierte el agua tomándola en çesto" (López de Ayala 1864, 431, strophe 210).

27. Ms. E-Bbc 1325/2, Biblioteca de Catalunya, ff. 21v-24 r. It has been dated between 1475-1525 by Ascensión Mazuela-Anguita (2014, 30); and at the beginning of the sixteenth century by Karl Werner Gümpel (1988, 29).

28. "Melodia es ornar y agraciar los sones del canto llano" ("Melody is ornamenting and embellishing sounds of plainchant"), phrase 20, quoted in Gümpel (1988, 30). According to Gümpel, the use of the word *melodia* as a generic term for vocal or rhythmic ornamentation follows a particular tradition to be found already in several medieval sources, inside and outside of Spain (Gümpel 1988, 30).

29. For example, the definition of the *glossadores:* "Glossadores. Los que interpretan glosando, [...] así como la glossa es la lengua del texto, así ocasional y acidentalmente la copia demasiada de glossas ha sido el enmudecimiento de lenguas y aterramiento de ingenios" (Cobarruvias 1977 [1611], 644).

words of caution regarding the overuse of glosses in books on music seem to signal a shift in the understanding of music. The most radical statement is Juan Bermudo's repeated recommendation to sing or play good music as it is written, without glosses.[30] Bermudo bases this general principle on formal and moral reasons that, he says, are in keeping with good music.

Regarding the formal issues, while Bermudo considers glosses appropriate for old music – given its *pesadumbre*, or "heaviness"– he considers that the short values and counterpoint of the new music make glosses "unnecessary".[31] On this point, Bermudo agrees with a vihuelist he praises, Enríquez Valderrábano, who states that the counterpoint of the "current" music "does not support the gloss."[32] Although Juan Bermudo acknowledges the technical problems that may arise from players' limited abilities to play glosses,[33] he takes the matter further by arguing that glosses spoil good music. Good music, he concludes, cannot *enmendarse* ("be corrected") because "excellent men" devoted their time to thoroughly composing their works.[34] Although many musicians considered glosses as a performance practice, I argue that the notion of gloss as correction to the original work is necessary in order to understand the work as closed or complete. This understanding of the gloss goes beyond the tradition of retelling and translating.[35]

Furthermore, Bermudo offers a key moral reason to support his view: the author's ownership of his work. Indeed, he goes as far as to require that instrumentalists ask authors for permission to gloss their works.[36] Alternatively, Miguel de Fuenllana accepted glosses added by the performers to the works included in his book, but he restricted their use to cadences or

30. "El tañedor sobre todas las cosas tenga un aviso: y es, que al poner la Musica no heche glosas, sino de la manera que esta puntado: se ha de poner" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 84v). "Tenga por aviso principal el que deste libro se quisiere aprovechar que en la música no heche glosas. La mayor corrupción y perdida de música que entre tañedores hallo es las importunas glosas" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 29v).

31. "Si la música de la ley vieja por su pesadumbre avia menester glosas: la de estos tiempos no tiene necesidad [...] Entendido tengo, que algunos las hechan [las glosas] porque no gustan del harmonia, y travazon que lleva la Musica de estos tiempos. Confiessan en ello su grande ignorancia, deshaziendo con importunas glosas la buena Musica, quitándole el buenayre, y las graciosas fugas" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 84v). "Es tan disminuyda y bolada la Musica de este tiempo que ella es texto y glosa" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 85r).

32. "No puse glosa en todo lo de compostura, porque mejor y con menos dificultad se pueda tañer y cada uno glose según su mano, y porque la música que ahora se compone lleva tanto contrapunto que no sufre glosa, aunque en algunos puse la que convenía como muestra para los que la quisieren tañer" (Valderrábano 1547, a3).

33. Similarly, Diego Ortiz considers that the limits of the player's ability are the main obstacle to glossing "aunque la glosa sea Buena si la mano no puede con ella no puede parecer bien y el defecto no será de la glosa" ("even if the gloss is good, when the hand is not able to achieve it, it will not look good, and the defect does not belong to the gloss") (Ortiz 1967 [1553], 5).

34. "No se yo como puede escapar un tañedor (poniendo obras de excelentes hombres) de mal criado, ignorante, y atrevido: si las glosa. Viene un Christoval de Morales, que es luz de España en la Musica, y un Bernardino de Figueroa, que es único en abilidades, y sobre estudio gastan mucho tiempo en componer un motete, y uno que no sabe canto llano (porque un día supo poner las manos en el órgano) se lo quiere enmendar" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 85r).

35. For an insightful study of "retelling" in Josquin's Masses see Wiesenfeldt (2021).

36. "Que otra cosa es echar glosas a una obra: sino pretender enmendarla? Ponen puntos demasiados a los quales el componedor no puso. Que otra cosa es esto: sino prestarle al componedor Musica: Saben los que de veras son cantores: que se tiene por afrenta entre los hombres de criança echar una boz a la obra de otro. Y si los ministriles, o cantores della tienen necesidad: piden licencia al que hizo la tal obra, y usan de otros complimientos. Y esto no es enmendar: sino suplir, o cumplir ruegos de amigos. El tañedor que echa glosas va enmendando, o por mejor decir borrando, todas las bozes" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 84v). "Si el tañedor fuere suficiente para echar glosas, porque es buen componedor: no las ponga en obras de otros. Haga Musica de su caudal, quite, y ponga quantos puntos quisiere como en cosa de su casa" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 85r.)

passages "which required them." Only once did he skip his own recommendation, in his glossed setting of Claudin de Sermisy's song *Tant que vivray* (Griffiths 2004, 364). Both Bermudo and Fuenllana's reasoning cannot be understood without a fidelity-based work-concept: glosses and *redobles* (runs)[37] disturb or blur the composition, they overshadow its truth.[38]

It appears, however, that Ortiz did not ask either Arcadelt or Sandrin for permission to publish the former's madrigal *O felicci occhi miei* or the latter's song *Douce memoire*. Neither did Santa María seem to have any objections to adding glosses, even though it entailed substantial distancing from the original work. The reason he gives for this is that not only could glosses be added to all the piece's parts, but that they also could be imitated.[39] Although Santa María does not develop this point further, it seems natural in the context of the sixteenth century repertoire, in which no part stood out from the rest. It seems then, that Bermudo and Fuenllana's strong notion of authorship was not shared by everybody who wrote about music.

b. The faithfulness to the work

Some sixteenth-century writers reflected on the best way to maintain a faithfulness to the original text in its translated versions. They emphasized the need to facilitate comprehension in another language, often through words or images that were not present in the original text. An example of this can be found in the prologue to the Spanish version of Baldassare Castiglione's *Il cortegiano* (1528), one the most popular books of that century in Spain. The poet Garcilaso de la Vega remarked that its translator, Juan Boscán, "through different paths put into this language [Spanish] all the strength and ornament from the other [Italian]".[40] Note that he uses the same verb with which the writers of musical treatises refer to the performance of vocal music with an instrument: *poner*, "to put." In similar fashion, when

37. Charles Jacobs translates *redobles* as "runs". I have followed his translations because they are the editions of the vihuelists available in English. However, "run" is associated to a fast scale wise passage, meanwhile *redoble* is a kind of trill in keyboard music by Santa María, Gonzalo de Baena or Correa de Arauxo (Noguera Guillén 2022, 352-353) and Bermudo (1957 [1555], 60v and 61r). In his study on Milán, Luis Gásser does not translate *redobles,* yet translates *glosas* as "runs" (2008, 105 and ss.)

38. "No pongo glosa todas vezes en las obras compuestas, porque no soy de opinión que con glosas ni redobles se obscurezca la verdad de la compostura, como vemos que algunos, contentos con sola su opinión, las obras que muy buenos autores han compuesto con excelente artificio y buen spiritu, puestas en sus manos las componen ellos de nuevo, cercándolas con no se que redobles, ordenados a su voluntad. Digo que si no fuere offreciendose clausula, o en tiempo que la misma compostura diere lugar no se deue en otra manera defraudar la compostura con las semejantes glosas y redobles, y como dicho tengo, por la causa que aquí digo, yo no la pongo en las obras de este libro, salvo al clausular, o en los lugares que la compostura lo demanda, como en las mismas obras se vera" (Fuenllana 1554, 5r) ("I do not gloss in transcriptions at all times, because I am of the opinion that, with glosses or redobles, the integrity of the composition is compromised. Thus we see that some, content with their opinion alone, compose anew works placed in their hands, which very fine authors have composed with excellent craft and good spirit, girding them with I don't know what redobles in conformance with their will. I maintain that if there is no cadence or [other] time when the composition itself allows, one should not, by [this or] another means, defraud the composition with such glosses or redobles; and as I have said, for the reason here stated, I do not use it [glossing] in the works of this book, save at cadences or in the places demanded by the composition, as will be seen in the works themselves.') Translated by Charles Jacobs (Fuenllana 1978, lxxxix).

39. "Para bien glosar una obra, dos cosas se han de notar. La una es que si se pudiere todas las bozes igualmente lleuen glosa, esto es, que tanta glosa lleue una boz como otra. La otra cosa es, que assi como se remedan las bozes, assi también se remeden las glosas con todas las bozes" (Santa María 1565, 58r). Neither does Sylvestro Ganassi (1535) intend to respect the original piece in his rules about diminutions and ornaments.

40. "por diferentes caminos puso en esta lengua [castellana] toda la fuerza y el ornamento de la otra [italiana]" (Garcilaso de la Vega 1972 [1534], 59).

he recommends to *poner* ("to put" or "to play") works intended for vocal ensembles with an instrument, Bermudo combines his wish to respect someone else's music with the need to adapt it. In short, he is concerned with what we could call the faithfulness to the work or *Werktraue.* We have already seen an example of this idea in Bermudo's demand that good music be played the way it is written. In the words of Bermudo, this fidelity is one of the traits of "the true singers."[41] It should be noted that, according to Goehr (2007, 243-286), this fidelity to the work originated during the nineteenth century, linked to the new musical work-concept.

When an instrument's range or some of its other characteristics does not allow for a faithful performance of the original piece, which was often the case with vihuelas, Bermudo suggests playing with several instruments or modifying the tuning. According to Bermudo, when faced with the choice between "adapting the music to the instrument, or adapting the instrument to the music," musicians "nowadays" keep the music *como la hallan* ("as they find it") while they "adapt the vihuelas" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 90v). Furthermore, Bermudo calls for innovation in the making of musical instruments.[42]

The issue of the fidelity to the work, however, was not restricted to intabulations. Addressing singers, Bermudo admits a certain flexibility with time-signatures for beginners, but he recommends that expert singers "keep the composer's time-signature, because the decorum and beauty of such composition must be kept."[43] Likewise, vihuelists Luis Milán and Enríquez de Valderrábano were careful to indicate the tempo for some of their pieces to ensure their work would be correctly appreciated.[44] In one particular instance, Milán even specifies how to perform certain passages, *redobles* ("runs") and *consonancias* ("consonances") and gives different instructions to the singer and the instrumentalist in the compositions for voice and vihuela (Milán 1536, 29, 32, 72 and ff.). Valderrábano advised the instrumentalist "to pay attention to the author's intention."[45]

41. "los que de veras son cantores" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 84v).

42. "Entiendan los que dessean ser tañedores, que la profundidad, anchura y largueza de la música no esta encerrada toda en los pequeños arroyos de los instrumentos. Tengo para mi (y persuadido que no me engaño) que pueden los tañedores siendo músicos inventar géneros de mas instrumentos y en los inventados innovar cada día. Pues para que un tañedor se muestre abil, no se contente con el temple de la vihuela común: sino témplela a su voluntad, y cifre conforme al temple, y tañendo aquello cifrado, solo él sabra tañer por semejante vihuela" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 93 v).

43. "guarden el compás del componedor: porque se guarde el decoro, y hermosura de la tal composición" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 51v).

44. "La qual música esta figurada por fantasías como abaxo vereys, desta manera que qualquiera obra deste libro de qualquier tono que sea se intitula fantasía a respecto que solo procede de la fantasia e industria del auctor que la hizo. El qual muy afectadamente ruega a todos los que por su libro passaran que no juzgen sus obras hasta que sean tañidas como cada uno querria que sus obras lo fuesen y tañidas en su perficion" (Milán 1536, 1, pdf 6). ("Which music is written out as fantasias, as you will see bellow; by sense that it only proceeds from the fantasy and industry of the author, who created it. Who very feelingly entreats all who pass through this book not to judge his works until they are played as each one would wish his works were. And played in their perfection, if they are not so perfect, they will be so in virtue and goodness, which excuse all faults"). English translation by Charles Jacobs in Milán (1971, 296).

45. "Una cosa sea de mirar para que la música de las fantasías y otras cosas en el presente libro se tañan de buen ayre: que se mire el tiempo y conforme a él se taña la dicha música porque si a de yr apriesa y se tañe a espacio no parecerá bien, y por esto es menester mirar la intención del Auctor. Esta regla de suso es para tañer perfectamente la cifra" (Valderrábano 1547, s. p.).

c. The wisdom in the work

Bermudo and Santa María place particular emphasis on the knowledge that musical works afford. This aspect is particularly important because it places value on a specific composition, rather than on the application of composing rules. If the composition is said to teach more than a treatise or a master's explanation, as Bermudo believes, then the work must hold a special quality.[46] Thus, some music could go beyond being a mere means of entertainment or an accompaniment to a ceremonial occasion, as it had been traditionally understood. According to Bermudo and Santa María, music could convey knowledge. In fact, some works stand out for their "singularity"; Fuenllana's remarks on Flecha's *ensaladas,* included in his book, *Orphenica lyra,* are a good example of this:

> One cannot fail to praise these works, since, without doubt, the said *ensaladas* are excellent in lyrics and unique in composition. He who plays this pot-pourri freely will be a good witness to this.[47]

Santa María outlined a plan to study and understand musical works, which closely resembles what any counterpoint teacher would recommend today: he advises the pupil to analyze 1) the invention and artifice carried out by the motives and the answer of the voices, 2) the entrance of every voice with respect to the cadence, 3) the types of cadences, 4) the consonances and dissonances, and 5) the differences between different imitations.[48] In relation to the study of cadences, Bermudo advises we look for them in compositions *de hombres doctos* ("by learned men"), which will help us to fully "understand" them.[49] Santa María adds that these cadences should be memorized so that one can compose from them *en la fantasía* ("in the imagination").[50]

At the end of his treatise, Bermudo sums up the three requirements of a good composition: first, the accordance between lyrics and music (decorum); second, the suitability of the style for the deepness of the chosen genre; and third, its gravity.[51] Any humanist contemporary with

---

46. "Tened por aviso principal, de aprender contrapunto de hombre que lo sepa bien y que tenga buen ayre, y buscad buenos libros, que dello hablen. Y esto no aprovechara tanto como ver obras de músicos excelentes. Creed, que ningún hombre sabio puro practico puede decir tanto por letras quanto descubrirá en la composición. Los que tuvieren por particular exercicio, y contino estudio mirar con mucha atención obras de grandes músicos: sabran bien componer, y pues que en nuestra España al presente los ay muchos y extremados: no aprovecharse el discípulo gran culpa será suya" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 135 r).

47. English translation by Charles Jacobs in Fuenllana (1978, xc). "No se le puede negar el loor a estas obras, pues sin dubda las dichas ensaladas tienen excelencia en la letra y singularidad en la compostura. Buen testigo será desto el que trabajare de gustar con libertad deste potaje" (Fuenllana 1554, 5v).

48. "Del modo que se ha de tener para sacar provecho de las obras" (Santa María 1565, lib. I, 58r. and v.)

49. "Para entender copiosamente qual es la clausula de tiple, qual de tenor, y qual de la contra mirareys de propósito (no tan solamente los exemplos en este puesto pero) todo lo compuesto de hombres doctos" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 136 v).

50. "notar todas las maneras de clausulas que se hicieren en las obras entendiéndolas de raíz y tenerlas en la memoria para por ellas hacer otras semejantes en la fantasía" (Santa María 1565, 57v). Cobarruvias defines "fantasía" as imagination (Cobarruvias 1977 [1611], 584).

51. "Sobre todo guarde el componedor el dechoro y hermosura en la letra. Lo primero en conformar el punto (según fue dicho en la composición de canto llano) quanto fuere posible con la letra. Dar pues a cada letra el punto que pide es hermosura. Lo segundo se debe guardar en la profundidad. No todo lo que compusieredes: sea de igual profundidad. Seguid en vuestra composición: el estilo del genero que componeys. Un estilo tiene el villancico, y otro la chançoneta, y cada cosa guarde su estilo y profundidad. El cantor que compusiesse un villancico tan profundo como el motete, y una chançoneta como la missa: no sería atinada composición. Guardese lo tercero en la gravedad. La Música no vaya tan apresurada, que parezca liviana: ni tan pesada que sea pesadumbre de ley vieja" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 135r).

Bermudo would be familiar with these conditions, which are repeated in the classical texts on rhetoric by Aristotle, Cicero and Quintilian. The levels of style (Plain, Middle, or Grand Style) belong to the Elocution. Gravity is part of the Delivery (Latin *Declamatio)*, so it affects the speed or tempo, the flow of the voice and the gestures with which the speech is delivered. In opposition to a good composition, is the *golpeada* ("beaten") music, to which Bermudo never refers as work. According to him, it was the most common music around 1500.[52] Years later, Francisco Salinas still emphasized the primitivism of secular polyphonic old music.[53] Bermudo classifies the available repertoire for players intending to intabulate other musicians' music, from the simplest pieces –homophonic *villancicos*–,[54] up to the imitative compositions of Gombert and the *fantasías*. He included this hierarchical organization twice in his treatise, with slight differences (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 60r and 99v):

> 1. Two- and three-part *villancicos* "de música golpeada, que comúnmente se dan todas las voces juntas" ("beaten music, where all the parts usually sound together").
>
> *2. Villancicos* composed by Juan Vázquez "que aunque son fáciles por ser en género de villancico no carecen de música para hazer fundamento" ("in spite of being simple *because* they belong to the genre of the *villancico*, they don't lack the solid grounds of music") and the music of Baltasar Tellez, because "es música recogida ni anda en muchos puntos ni se aparta mucho una voz de otra al dar del golpe" ("it is collected music, it does not go across many points nor does one part move away from another when striking a beat/hit").
>
> 3. Masses by Cristóbal de Morales, music by Josquin, Adriano [Willaert], Iachet Mantuano, and master [Bernardino de] Figueroa.
>
> 4. "Lo último que habéis de poner sea música del excelente Gomberth" [...] "por ser derramada" ("Lastly, you must play music by the excellent Gombert [...] because of it being spilled").
>
> 5. He advises not to play music by instrumentalists, with the exception of "don Juan [Doyz] racionero en la Iglesia de Málaga", "racionero [Pedro de] Villada en la Iglesia de Sevilla", "Mosén [Pedro Alberch] Vila en Barcelona, [Francisco de] Soto y a Antonio de Cabezón".[55]
>
> 6. Beginners shall not play *fantasías*.

52. "El que tañedor desea ser, no ponga música golpeada, que es pesadumbre de ley vieja, sino la que se usa en este tiempo" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 27r.); "Este temple más es para romances viejos, y música golpeada que para música del tiempo" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 28v). "La composición de ahora cincuenta años, y aun la que se usaua quando yo me crie daban comúnmente todas las vozes juntas. Musica es esta, que se deven guardar della: como de barbarismo en gramatica. El canto de ahora va eslabonado y tan asido que apenas da una voz junctamente con otra" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 135r).

53. "the polyphonic music that used to be sung at banquets and secular gatherings is not so difficult that it could not be sung without books" "Praeterea is musicae cantus, qui ad liberalis caetus et in conuiuiis principum adhiberi solet, non est hic plurium vocum artificiosus, qui nisi conspectus libris cantari non potest" (Salinas 1958 [1577], Book VI, Chapter I, 288).

54. The title of the so-called *Cancionero de Uppsala* (Songbook of Uppsala) also emphasizes that *villancicos* are intended for beginners: *Villancicos de diversos autores [...] para que puedan aprovechar los que a cantar començaren*. Venettis, Apud Hieronymum Scotum, 1556 ("Villancicos of different authors [...] to be benefited from by beginners at singing").

55. Juan Bermudo offers a similar discussion of good instrumentalists in his earlier and shorter treatise (Bermudo 1550, 24r). See Stevenson (1960, 41).

These laudatory remarks on authors and their works do not mention the works' function. What could be the function, for example, of the vihuela intabulation of Josquin's mass-movements? The vihuela was not allowed in liturgy. In consequence, no Spanish cathedral or church regularly employed vihuelists, and there is no documented evidence registering the occasional presence of this instrument in the mass. In my opinion, this sacred music was intabulated for the pleasure of players[56] or as a part of what –according to William Weber (1999)– we could call a pedagogical canon.

d. Overcoming the past

Taking pleasure in newness is a well-known *topos* in the Renaissance (Maravall 1966), and as such, novelty was often used as a commercial strategy. For instance, books always presented themselves as novel. However, regarding the musical work-concept, the perfection achieved by new music –rather than its novelty– seems more significant. This is a recurrent issue in Bermudo's *Declaración*.[57] Music, says Bermudo, has undergone a process which puts it at the same level as the achievements of Antonio de Nebrija in grammar, of Luis Vives in the Latin language, and of Erasmus *en el modo de decir* ("in the way of saying"): it has reached its perfection.[58]

Bermudo draws on another Renaissance *topos* to convey the concept of historical progress: that musicians of today are dwarfs on the shoulders of giants ("the works of the musicians of yore"), so that "we can see more than what they saw."[59] The friar explicitly states that musicians "have resurrected a part of the lost music." Although, for Bermudo, the *pesadumbre* ("heaviness") of earlier music has been overcome in the present time, the level of the music "of the days of Pythagoras" has not yet been reached.[60] Here we encounter a "divided retrospection": the conscious detachment of humanists from their immediate and rejected past, and a nostalgic

56. The notion of music as a learned pastime for men (not for women) is found, for example, in Luis Vives' *Linguae Latinae Exercitatio* (1538), which circulated widely throughout Europe as a manual of Latin Language. Here Vives presents songs accompanied by the vihuela, some of which were composed by himself. On the social milieu of vihuelists, see Griffiths (2004).

57. "cuando la Musica començo no sabían cantar Musica concertada: sino a sola una voz. De las palabras de Boecio saco, que Mercurio uso guitarra: y Orpheo la augmento, y la hizo vihuela. De lo que Nichomacho dixo: infiero la variedad de los tiempos que la música ha tenido, y aunque la Musica ahora ha venido a tanta perfection que tangan a cinco y a seis bozes, y cantan a ocho y a mas: no por ello se han perdido los instrumentos que tañen a una boz. De tal manera los instrumentos perfectos de este tiempo avemos de conservar, y augmentar quanto pudiéremos que sepamos los que los antiguos usaron. Por lo qual me parecio resuscitar la guitarra del gran Mercurio" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 96v-97r).

58. "Quanto el doctissimo Antonio de Lebrixa aumentó el arte de la gramática, el latinissimo Ludovico Vives la lengua latina, casta, y natural, el peritissimo y estudiosissimo Erasmo el modo de decir, no está escondido a los doctos. Ciertamente no podemos negar que en nuestros tiempos habemos visto en todas las artes cosas nuevas, las cuales los antiguos no tuvieron. No hay hombre que se acuerde haber visto (por mucho que haya vivido) estar la Música tan subida de color de toda perfección como la vemos el día de hoy. Siempre los excelentísimos varones han pretendido aumentar el arte diciendo cosas allende del, pero ninguno contra arte aprobado es razón que hable" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 66v).

59. "Los músicos de estos tiempos somos enanos. Si sobre los ombros (que son los trabajos de los músicos antiguos) nos ponemos: mas podemos ver que todos ellos. Si quisiéramos sin arte (que es la vista, que nos dexaron) con ellos competir: quedaremos en la Musica tan cortos de vista como el enano puesto en la tierra" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 5r).

60. "Los cantores y tañedores de este tiempo han resuscitado parte de la música perdida. Grandes son los primeros que en este tipo se usan en la música, pero no son tan nuevos, que no los hallemos en la música de los antiguos. Los que solamente vieron la música, o por mejor decir pesadumbre de ahora cincuenta años dizen que nunca tan subida estuvo la música como en nuestro tiempo. El que sabe la música del tiempo de Pythagoras y la de antes, y después un poco tiene que llorar" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 12r).

re-evaluation or re-creation of an earlier past, the antiquity.[61] On occasion we find in Bermudo an astonishingly relativistic stance. For instance, he states that consonance and dissonance change over time and goes on to explain that this is the reason why old singers do not like to sing intervals of new music.[62]

According to Diego Pisador, the mere fact of publishing a book of music attests to the superiority of the music of his time over the music of Linus and Orpheus, who were unable to pass on their musical legacy as an immortal "science." Insofar as this statement belongs to Pisador's prologue in his own printed music book for vihuela, it was possible for the reader to infer that Pisador (and coevals) had achieved this alleged superiority.[63]

Conclusions

A careful examination of several books on music published in Spanish in the middle of the sixteenth century reveals that some musical pieces were considered distinctively accomplished and finished. Such pieces were worth studying because of the knowledge they afforded and their associations with authors of outstanding talent (or even, in certain cases, of an innate talent), as well as their superiority over music written fifty years earlier. The music pieces often referred to as works were mass movements, motets, and *fantasias*. It was recent pieces which were referred to as works, as the older music was regarded as simpler, and consequently, more suitable for being glossed. Unlike other pieces of music, these superior works had to be performed as they had been originally written. Hence, as well as recommending avoiding glosses when playing "works," music books sometimes provided instructions for performance. The performance, as Miguel de Fuenllana argues, should not obscure or disturb the original work as it was intended by its author.

Thus, Listenius's commentaries on the accomplishment of Josquin's music were similar to those written in Spanish between 1536 and 1565 by widely-read music theorists and composers. The hermeneutic tradition, printing laws, court life, and some composers' activity as poets and authors favored a propitious context for both an awareness of authorship and the musical work-concept in sixteenth-century Spain. It seems, however, that these ideas did not spread outside the circle of the most cultivated or courtly musicians whose books are quoted above: Luis Milán, Juan Bermudo, Enríquez de Valderrábano, and Miguel de Fuenllana.

---

61. On the "divided retrospection," see Strohm (1999, 10).

62. "El uso de el oydo es gran parte para hazer una consonancia, y por esto según la variedad de los tiempos se han mudado las consonancias. La que en un tiempo aceptan y reciben por consonancia, en otro tiempo la reprueban y la que en un tiempo reprueban en otro la reciben. Si esto se haze contra arte aprobada, será consonancia solamente para el que la usare, y si es allende de el arte por varones excelentes recibido, será absolutamente consonancia que de nuevo se añadió. Los que han leydo muchos libros de Musicas sabran quanta variedad ha tenido no solamente en los generos y especies, sino en las consonancias particulares. [...] Claro está que unos cantantes viejos no los sacaréis de Pues que jamás, y de otras canciones de Música golpeada a este tono, porque en ella se criaron. No sufrirán estos tales una séptima, o segunda como las dan músicos de España, porque los oídos tienen criados y cebados en la pesadumbre de la ley vieja" (Bermudo 1957 [1555], 65v-66r).

63. "pero con ser [Lino y Orfeo] tan acabados en su arte, y que parecía no les faltara cosa alguna para llegar a la cumbre bien mirado me atrevo a decir que fueron mancos músicos, o por mejor decir les falto tanta perficion quanta avian alcançado pues que no hallamos rastro ni leemos en algunas hystorias que supiesen alguna arte con la qual pudiessen dexar a sus succesores aquella sciencia que ellos avian inventado, o deprendieron de sus maestros para que ya que en ellos fenesciesse quedasse en los libros perpetua y inmortal" (Pisador 1552, 2r, pdf 7).

There remains much to study about the order and planning of compositions in sixteenth-century books of music. Although there is an obvious distribution of a kind (there are authors who order their pieces according to musical modes or degrees of difficulty), there is no systematization that vaguely resembles the series of sonatas and concertos published as Opus in the eighteenth century. Sixteenth-century ideas about the musical work were very different from those of the eighteenth century: *Kunstreligion* (Art as religion) and *Gefühlsästhetik* (Aesthetic of sentiments), for example, were still far off in the future. However, in the same way that, while working for the RAI in Milan, Umberto Eco was urged by the new music to write *The Open Work,* any musicologist dealing with Spanish musical sources must acknowledge the existence of a sixteenth-century work-concept.

Bibliography

Adorno, Theodor W. 1973 [1948]. *Philosophy of Modern Music*. New York: The Seabury Press.

Anonymous. 1556. *Villancicos de diversos autores [...] para que puedan aprovechar los que a cantar començaren*. Venettis: Apud Hieronymum Scotum.

Anonymous from Seville. 1480/2. *Ars Mensurabilis et inmensurabilis cantus*, E-*E* c.III.23

Anonymous. 1496-1520. *Cancionero de Palacio*. Madrid, Palacio Real, Biblioteca, Ms. II-1335, https://rbdigital.realbiblioteca.es/s/realbiblioteca/item/2396 (accessed 25 January 2025).

Bermudo, Fray Juan. 1957 [1555]. *Declaración de instrumentos musicales 1555*. Edición facsímil. Kassel: Bärenreiter.

Bermudo, Juan. 1550. *El arte Tripharia*. Osuna: Juan de León.

Butt, John. 2015. "What is a 'Musical Work'? Reflections on the Origins of the 'Work Concept' in Western Art Music". In *Concepts of Music and Copyright: How Music Perceives Itself and How Copyright Perceives Music*, edited by Andreas Rahmatian, 1-22. Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Cabezón, Antonio de. 1578. *Obras de música para tecla, arpa y vihuela,* Madrid: Francisco Sánchez, BNE R/3891 BDH. https://bdh-rd.bne.es/viewer.vm?id=0000037786 (accessed 25 January 2025).

Cabezón, Hernando de. 1578. "Proemio". In *Obras de música para tecla, arpa y vihuela,* by Antonio de Cabezón. Madrid: Francisco Sánchez, BNE R/3891 BDH. https://bdh-rd.bne.es/viewer.vm?id=0000037786 (accessed 25 January 2025).

Cobarruvias, Sebastián de. 1977 [1611]. *Tesoro de la lengua castellana o española*. Edición facsímil. Madrid: Turner.

Colella, Alfonso. 2019. *Música y cultura renacentista entre Valencia y Nápoles: la corte valenciana de Fernando de Aragon, duque de Calabria.* Madrid: Sociedad Española de Musicología.

Dahlhaus, Carl. 1987 [1978]. "On the Decline of the Concept of the Musical Work." In *Schoenberg and the New Music,* 220-233. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

_____. 1987 [1978]. "The Musical Work of Art as a Subject of Sociology". In *Schoenberg and the New Music*, 235-247. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Eagleton, Terry. 1990. *The Ideology of the Aesthetic*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Blackwell.

Eco, Umberto. 1989 [1962]. *The Open Work*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Eggebrecht, Hans H. 1977. "Opusmusik". In *Musikalisches Denken. Aufsätze zur Theorie und Ästhetik der Musik*. Wilhelmshaven: Heirchshoven.

Freis, Wolfgang. 1995. "Becoming a Theorist: The Growth of Bermudo's *Declaración de instrumentos musicales*". *Revista de Musicología* XVIII (1-2): 27-112.

Fuenllana, Miguel de. 1554. *Libro de música para vihuela, intitulado Orphenica Lyra en el qual se contienen muchas y diversas obras.* Sevilla: Martín Montes de Oca. BNE R/9278 http://bdh-rd.bne.es/viewer.vm?id=0000188748&page=1 (accessed 25 January 2025).

_____. 1978. *Orphénica Lyra (Seville 1554).* Edited and translated by Charles Jacobs. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Gállego, Julián. 1976. *El pintor de artesano a artista.* Granada: Universidad de Granada.

Ganassi, Sylvestro. 1535. *Opera Intitolata Fontegara Laquale insegna a sonare di flauto…* Venezia: Sylvestro Ganassi.

Garcilaso de la Vega. 1972. [1534] "A la muy magnífica Señora doña Gerónima Palova de Almogavar". In *El cortesano* by B. de Castiglione. Edited by T. Suero Roca. Barcelona: Bruguera.

Gásser, Luis. 1996. *Luis Milán on Sixteenth-Century Performance Practice*. Bloomington, Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Goehr, Lydia. 2007. *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works. An Essay in the Philosophy of Music*. Revised edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Gómez Fernández, Lucía. 2017. *Música, nobleza y mecenazgo. Los duques de Medina Sidonia en Sevilla y Sanlúcar de Barrameda (1445-1615).* Cádiz: Universidad de Cádiz.

Griffiths, John. 1993."The Printing of Instrumental Music". *Revista de Musicología* 16 (6): 3309-3321.

_____. 2004. "La vihuela en la época de Felipe II". In *Políticas y prácticas musicales en el mundo de Felipe II: estudios sobre la música en España, sus instituciones y sus territorios en la segunda mitad del siglo XVI,* edited by John Griffiths and Javier Suárez-Pajares, 350-379. Madrid: Instituto Complutense de Ciencias Musicales.

Gümpel, Karl Werner. 1988. "El Canto Melódico de Toledo. Algunas reflexiones sobre su origen". *Recerca Musicològica* VIII: 25–45.

López de Ayala, Pedro. 1864 [1378-1402]. "Rimado de Palacio". In *Poetas castellanos anteriores al siglo XV*. Madrid: Ribadeneyra.

López Suero, Ana. 2021. "The Network of Musicians in Valladolid, 1550–1650: Training, Companies, Livelihoods, and Related Crafts and Trades". PhD thesis, Universidad de Valladolid.

Lowinsky, Edward E. 1989 [1964]. "Musical Genius: Evolution and Origin of a Concept". In *Music in the Culture of the Renaissance and other Essays*, edited by Bonnie J. Blackburn, I: 87-105. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Lütteken, Laurenz. 2015. "The Work Concept". In *The Cambridge History of Fifteenth Century Music,* edited by Anna Maria Busse Berger and Jesse Rodin, 55-68. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Maravall, José Antonio. 1966. *Antiguos y modernos. La idea de progreso en el desarrollo inicial de una sociedad*. Madrid: Sociedad de estudios y publicaciones.

Mazuela-Anguita, Ascensión. 2014. *Artes de canto en el mundo ibérico renacentista: difusión y usos a través del Arte de Canto Llano (Sevilla, 1530) de Juan Martínez*. Madrid: Sociedad Española de Musicología.

Milán, Luis. 1536. *Libro de música de vihuela de mano. Intitulado El Maestro...* Valencia: Francisco Díaz Romano. R/14752 R/9281 BdH http://bdh-rd.bne.es/viewer.vm?id=0000022795&page=1 (accessed 25 January 2025).

_____. 1971. *El Maestro*. Edition, translation and transcription by Charles Jacobs. University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press.

Mudarra, Alonso. 1546. *Tres libros de música en cifra para vihuela*. Sevilla: Juan de León. BNE R/14630, BDH https://bdh-rd.bne.es/viewer.vm?id=0000108275&page=1 (accessed 25 January 2025).

Nebrija, Antonio de. 1954. [1494] *Vocabulario español-latino, 1494*. Edición facsímil. Madrid: Real Academia Española.

Noguera Guillén, Jesús. 2022. "L'interprétation de la musique espagnole pour clavier au Siècle d'Or. De la lexicologie à la pratique". In *Musique et lexique à la Renaissance. Une approche de la musique ancienne par ses mots,* edited by Cristina Diego Pacheco y Amaya S. García Pérez, 331-355. Paris: Classiques Garnier.

Ortiz, Diego. 1967 [1553]. *Tratado de glosas sobre clausulas y otros géneros de puntos en la música de violones Roma, 1553.* Edición facsímil. Kassel: Bärenreiter.

Otaola González, Paloma. 2000. *Tradición y modernidad en los escritos musicales de Juan Bermudo: Del "Libro primero" (1549) a la "Declaración de instrumentos musicales" (1555).* Kassel: Edition Reichenberger.

Palencia, Alfonso de. 1490. *Universal vocabulario en latín y en romance*. Sevilla: Paulus de Colonia http://bdh.bne.es/bnesearch/biblioteca/Universal%2vocabulario%20en%20latin%20y%20en%20romance%20%20%20%20%20/qls/Palencia,%20Alfonso%20de%20(1423%201492)/qls/bdh0000176485;jsessionid=F38BB0944E304760D31E89E91AB62EE7 (accessed 25 January 2025).

Pisador, Diego.1552. *Libro de música de vihuela*. Salamanca: Diego Pisador, R/9280 BDH http://bdh-rd.bne.es/viewer.vm?id=0000011806&page=1 (accessed 25 January 2025).

Rami, Bartolomei. 1901 [1482]. *Musica Practica.* Edited by Johannes Wolf. Leipzig: Bratkopf -Hartel. https://bdh-rd.bne.es/viewer.vm?id=0000073722&page=1 (accessed 25 January 2025).

Roa Alonso, Francisco Javier. 2015. "Alonso Mudarra, vihuelista en la Casa del Infantado y canónigo en la Catedral de Sevilla". PhD Thesis, Universidad Complutense de Madrid.

Salinas, Francisco. 1958 [1577]. *De Musica*. Faksimile-Nachdruck. Kassel: Bärenreiter.

Santa María, Fray Thomás de. 1565. *Libro llamado Arte de tañer fantasía, assi para tecla como para vihuela y todo instrumento*...Valladolid: Francisco Fernández de Córdoba.

Schwartz, Roberta Freund. 2001. "*En busca de liberalidad:* Music and Musicians in the Courts of the Spanish Nobility, 1470–1640". PhD thesis, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign ProQuest Dissertations & Theses, 3023190.

Stevenson, Robert. 1960. *Juan Bermudo.* The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff.

Strohm, Reinhard. 1999. "Postmodern Thought and the History of Music: Some Intersections". *Revista Portuguesa de Musicologia* 9: 7-24.

_____. 2000. "Looking Back at Ourselves: The Problem with the Musical Work-concept". In *The Musical Work: Reality or Invention?* edited by Michael Talbot, 128–52. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press.

_____. 2010. "Opus: An Aspect of the Early History of the Musical Work Concept". In *Musik des Mittelalters und der Renaissance. Festchrift Klaus-Jürgen Sachs zum 80. Geburstag,* edited by Rainer Kleinertz, Christoph Flamm, Wolf Frobenius, 205-217. Hildesheim: Georg Olms.

_____. 2013. "Werk-Performanz-Konsum: Der musikalische Werk-Diskurs". In *Historische Musikwisseschaft. Grundlagen und Perspectiven* edited by Michele Calella and Nikolaus Urbanek, 341-355. Stuttgart: J. B. Metzle.

Talbot, Michel. 2000. "The Work-Concept and Composer-Centredness". In *The Musical Work: Reality or Invention?* edited by Michael Talbot, 169-186, Liverpool: Liverpool University Press.

Tatarkiewicz, Wladyslaw. 1980 [1976]. *A History of Six Ideas: An Essay on Aesthetics.* The Hague: M. Ninjoff.

Valderrábano, Enríquez de. 1547. *Libro de música de vihuela, intitulado Silva de Sirenas*. Valladolid: Francisco Fernández de Córdoba. R/14018 BNE, BDH http://bdh-rd.bne.es/viewer.vm?id=0000011809&page=1.

Van Orden, Kate. 2014. *Music, Authorship, and the Book in the First Century of Print*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Vásquez, Juan. 1946 [1560]. *Recopilación de Sonetos y Villancicos a quatro y a cinco (Sevilla, 1560)* editado por Higinio Anglés. Barcelona: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, Instituto Español de Musicología.

Venegas de Henestrosa, Luis. 1557. *Libro de cifra nueva para tecla, harpa y vihuela.* Alcalá: Juan de Brocar. BNE R/6497 BDH; https://bdh-rd.bne.es/viewer.vm?id=0000039213&page=1.

Weber, William. 1999, 2010. "The History of Musical Canon". In *Rethinking Music*, edited by Nicholas Cook and Mark Everist, 336-355. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Wiesenfeldt, Christiane. 2021. "Zwischen Ordo und Varietas. Strategien des Wiedererzählens in Josquins Messenschaffen". In *Musik-Konzepte. Josquin des Prez*, edited by Ulrich Tadday, Xl: 50-59.

Wiora, Walter. 1988. *Das musikalische Kunstwerk.* Tutzing: Schneider.

Woodley, Ronald. 2001. 'Tinctoris, Johannes'. In *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*, accessed 31 August 2014.

Young, James O. 2011. "Kivy on Musical Genius". *British Journal of Aesthetics* 51 (1): 1-12. Translated in Chapter 5 of Young, James O. 2017. *Filosofía de la música. Respuestas a Peter Kivy*. Introduction, translation and edition by Daniel Martín Sáez. Logroño: Calanda Music.

_____. 2023. "The Origins of Musical Genius" and "Genius and Creativity". In *A History of Western Philosophy of Music,* 148-157 Oxford: Oxford University Press.

R